

CANYON COUNTY PLANNING & ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING HELD Thursday, June 12, 2025

Thursday, June 12, 2025 6:30 P.M.

1ST FLOOR PUBLIC MEETING ROOM SUITE 130, CANYON COUNTY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

Commissioners Present:

Robert Sturgill, Chairman

Brian Sheets, Vice Chairman

Harold Nevill, Commission Secretary Geoff Mathews, Commissioner Matt Dorsey, Commissioner

Staff Members Present:

Jay Gibbons, Director of Development Services

Dan Lister, Planning Supervisor Deb Root, Principal Planner Karla Nelson, Principal Planner Amber Lewter, Associate Planner Caitlin Ross, Hearing Specialist

Chairman Sturgill called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

Commissioner Nevill read the testimony guidelines and proceeded to the first business item on the agenda.

<u>Item 1: Consent Agenda – Action Items</u>

A. April 17, 2025 MINUTES

- B. May 1, 2025 MINUTES
- C. Case No. CU2024-0009 Sunroc Corporation: Approve FCO's
- D. Case No. CU2024-0011 Lanum: Approve FCO's

Commissioner Mathews abstained from voting on item 1B, Commissioner Dorsey abstained from voting on items 1A and 1B, and Chairman Sturgill abstained from voting on items 1C and 1D, due to not being present for the correlated hearings.

Motion: Commissioner Sheets moved to approve the Consent Agenda, seconded by Commissioner Nevill. Voice vote, motion carried.

Item 2A:

<u>Case No. CU2024-0013 – The Wild Oak, LLC</u>: The applicant, Derek Olson, represented by Rafael Sanchez with Provost & Pritchard Consulting Group, is requesting a Conditional Use Permit for a special events facility named The Wild Oak on approximately 3.72 acres in an "A" (Agricultural) zone. The subject property is located at 19781 Middleton Rd, Caldwell, ID 83605, also referenced as Parcel R34316.

On April 3, 2025, this case was continued to a date certain of June 5, 2025. Due to scheduling, the June 5, 2025 hearing was rescheduled to June 12, 2025.

Chairman Sturgill affirmed the applicant to testify.

Matt Barnes - (Representative) IN FAVOR - 1965 S Eagle Rd, Ste 140, Meridian, ID 83642

Mr. Barnes reviewed the request of a conditional use permit for a special events facility. The venue can host up to 150 events per year with a capacity of 220 attendees. This case was continued to obtain plans for water and wastewater, and after meeting with DEQ and Southwest District Health, the applicant agreed to upgrade to a transient non-community water system as well as updating the site plan to accommodate an approved septic system. Mr. Barnes also explained a few changes regarding paving the right of way to Middleton Road and parking surfacing. Originally, the request for music was to end at 11:00 p.m., but music will now cease at 10:00 p.m. to allow for guests to clear by 11:00 p.m. He reiterated the building would be fully enclosed and more trees would be planted to help mitigate noise and traffic concerns, and light sources would be turned down and directly towards the property.

Commissioner Nevill asked for clarification on a transient non-community water system. Mr. Barnes explained it is a higher water quality standard than a private residential system, and is designed for small commercial systems with no residential use. Commissioner Nevill inquired on the type of events the applicant is proposing, which is mainly weddings and receptions, and confirmed the plan for the planting of more trees. He also asked the representative to convince the commissioners that 150 events was feasible, and Mr. Barnes explained their plans of keeping everything indoors and reducing the shutoff time to mitigate noise and to be mindful of the neighbors.

Commissioner Sheets confirmed the applicant's interest in obtaining the county definitions for landscaping, street buffering and parking standards. Mr. Barnes stated they wanted to do ag-based surfacing and reached out to the City of Caldwell who confirmed it was not a requirement. Commissioner Sheets asked about the timeframe to finish construction, to which Mr. Barnes commented 6 months might not be enough time, but understands the county's position on not dragging it out too long. Commissioner Sheets also confirmed conditions placed regarding lighting and parking would be acceptable.

Commissioner Dorsey asked why a gravel parking lot would give a "rural feel" and if there was a dust mitigation plan. Mr. Barnes stated they wanted more of a country rural feel than pavement.

Chairman Sturgill confirmed the proposed limit of 200 guests, 220 including vendors.

Planner Amber Lewter reviewed the changes to the Staff Report for the record.

Commissioner Sheets asked if any of the new information affected any of the conditions that were originally proposed. Planner Lewter said not with staff. Commissioner Sheets confirmed that the new information would be considered for the conditions for the FCOs.

Chairman Sturgill affirmed the witnesses to testify.

Testimony:

<u>Derek Olson – (Applicant) IN FAVOR – 999 W Waning Lane, Eagle, ID 83616</u>

Mr. Olson explained the events facility is his family's livelihood, so limiting to just 50 events per year would be challenging. He also clarified there would potentially be small social gatherings in addition to weddings and ceremonies, such as a décor showroom with a coffee shop, to provide for and involve the community. Mr. Olson stated he has met with neighbors and addressed any concerns and are respectful of the area.

Commissioner Nevill asked for clarification on the coffee shop as that could require rezoning to a commercial zone. Mr. Olson clarified it would not be a coffee shop as far as a business and selling coffee, but more of a coffee stand for guests to enjoy a cup of coffee while at some of these events. Commissioner

Nevill confirmed the applicant would be open to rezoning to commercial if they did choose to expand their operations. After some discussion, Commissioner Nevill asked if conditioning the number events to 130 to 170 events per year would be adequate, to which Mr. Olson agreed that would be sufficient and offered adding no events on Mondays and Tuesdays to have breaks between events.

Peter Goeman - IN OPPOSITION - 16981 Alleghenny Way, Caldwell, ID 83605

Mr. Goeman explained his concerns regarding noise, lights and operating hours. The proposed location is adjacent to a residential subdivision. He is happy to see the applicant is proposing an earlier shutoff time, but is wondering if there could be more limitations on the number of events per year. Mr. Goeman expressed concerns about alcohol being served and amplifying the noise and other issues, and requested that if this application is approved that reasonable restrictions are considered.

Matt Barnes – (Representative) REBUTTAL – 1965 S Eagle Rd, Ste 140, Meridian, ID 83642

Mr. Barnes believes the prior concerns regarding noise and lighting had already been addressed, and commented that there may not be as many events during the winter, and during the summer it's still light out close to 10, so the lights concern shouldn't be as big of an issue. He stated their ultimate goal is to work with everyone and mitigate issues as best as they can.

Commissioner Dorsey confirmed that the music would end at 10:00 p.m., which would allow everyone to be off the property by 11:00 p.m.

Chairman Sturgill asked if the representative knew the distance in feet or yards between the venue and the closest residence. After some research, it was determined the venue was roughly 180 to 200 feet to nearby properties.

MOTION: Commissioner Mathews moved to close public testimony on Case No. CU2024-0013, seconded by Commissioner Nevill. Voice vote, motion carried.

Deliberation:

Commissioner Nevill stated he is not in favor of this application due to it being inappropriate to put a year-round event center next to a subdivision. Commissioner Mathews agreed with Commissioner Nevill. Commissioner Sheets brought up that the future land use is commercial, and believes conditions could be crafted to adequately address some of the issues that have been discussed. Commissioner Dorsey agreed with Commissioner Sheets, and stated his only reservation is why the property is not being annexed into the city.

MOTION: Commissioner Sheets moved to **approve** Case No. CU2024-0013, adopting the FCOs that the application does meet criteria, while amending conditions 8b and 11b, adding the slide addressing concerns and considerations the applicant presented, and adding conditions that all amplified music shall decease by 10:00 p.m., a maximum of 150 events per year, and the parking lot shall not be paved. Seconded by Commissioner Dorsey.

Discussion on the Motion:

Commissioner Nevill asked if the condition regarding the total number of guests should be considered. Commissioner Sheets stated he does not have any measured way to justify an increase or decrease outside of what's in the proposal. Commissioner Nevill confirmed that adding a condition regarding an emergency plan would also be sufficient.

Roll call vote: 3 in favor, 2 opposed, motion passes.

For the record, Commissioner Dorsey left during the break, but there is still a quorum present.

Item 2B:

<u>Case No. RZ2022-0012 – McGuire</u>: The applicant, William B. McGuire, represented by Bristlecone Land Use Consulting, requests a Conditional Rezone of Parcel R32862, approximately 63 acres, from an "A" (Agricultural) zone to a "CR-R-1" (Conditional Rezone - Single Family Residential) zone. The request includes a development agreement limiting residential development to a one-acre average minimum lot size with no more than 48 buildable lots and will provide fire hydrants to serve subsequent subdivision development. The subject property is located at 15453 Karcher Rd, also referenced as Parcel R32862, R32862010.

On March 20, 2025, this case was continued to a date uncertain.

Chairman Sturgill affirmed the applicant to testify.

Elizabeth Allen – (Representative) IN FAVOR – 1330 Williams Lane, Nampa, ID 83686

Ms. Allen described the location of the property and their request for a conditional rezone for a subdivision. She also talked about a conceptual plan regarding access to the proposed subdivision. Since the prior hearing, it was discovered Caldwell Fire Department would have to sign off on the building permits to ensure adequate fire access and water; therefore, all subdivisions, regardless of annexation, must meet the minimum standards of fire flow and hydrants. Idaho Department of Water Resources did not have any concerns about water depletion in the area, and the proposed plan is individual wells. Ms. Allen addressed a concern from the prior hearing regarding wildlife, and described the property outside of the Deer Flat National Wildlife Refuge or lands designated for hunting. Surrounding farmers are in support of the application, and will continue farming until the inability to do so. Current access sites will not be affected. The impact to the school distract was not proposed to be of huge significance, and nothing was brought up from the school district regarding mitigation. Ms. Allen stated she believes the conditional rezone and subsequent subdivision will be compatible with the area.

Chairman Sturgill asked for clarification on the oversight for wells. Ms. Allen stated she did not have all of the details, Planning Supervisor Lister may be able to elaborate, but there would be penalties for overuse of water, which hasn't existed before.

Planning Supervisor Dan Lister reviewed the amended Staff Report for the record.

Commissioner Sheets confirmed that the maps about geese was showing there is no hunting, but geese are still present.

Commissioner Nevill asked about the water enforcement, to which Planning Supervisor Lister was also not familiar with, but offered to print the plan for review.

Commissioner Mathews asked who the neighbors to the south were. Planning Supervisor Lister reiterated this was a farmer who is in the middle of developing it.

Chairman Sturgill affirmed the witnesses to testify.

Testimony:

<u>Tom Whittemore – IN OPPOSITION – 15220 Castle Way, Caldwell, ID 83607</u>

Mr. Whittemore is serving as the president of El Rancho Subdivision, and mentioned there were over 100 signature submitted expressing concern about the development. He also expressed concerns about the

water and wells going dry, and reviewed an article from the newspaper years prior regarding the aquifer going dry in eastern Idaho. Although that is not close, it is still a concern in the Treasure Valley. Recycled and surface water is being used to help with water levels in the aquifers. Surrounding neighbors in an area of one of Mr. Whittemore's properties had to re-drill wells due to the water levels dropping. He believes a study should be conducted to ensure sufficient water resources for the new subdivision. Mr. Whittemore clarified they are not opposed to the development, but opposed to how it might affect the water.

Mr. Whittemore's three (3) minutes of testimony expired. Chairman Sturgill approved an extra minute of testimony.

Mr. Whittemore continued with requesting clarification on the exits and where they are located.

Commissioner Nevill asked about city water. Mr. Whittemore believes city water is connected at Mallard Park, but is unsure of where and whether that is including any of the surrounding subdivisions. Commissioner Nevill asked if it was conditioned that this new subdivision was connected to the city, would that help with his concerns? Mr. Whittemore stated it would, as long as existing water supplies are not adversely affected by the continued development.

Elizabeth Allen - (Representative) REBUTTAL - 1330 Williams Lane, Nampa, ID 83686

Ms. Allen mentioned the option to connect to city water and sewer was not available at this time due to upgrades to the system and potentially elevation. She also explained prior wells were likely failing due to how the wells were installed, not because of the aquifer, and that all wells eventually need serviced to continue working properly, or new wells need drilled. Ms. Allen exhibited the ingress and egress areas.

Commissioner Nevill asked for clarification on the expansion for Hwy 55, to which Ms. Allen described what was shown on the picture was the concept plan and the right of way for the expansion.

Planning Supervisor Lister added for the record that this was just the first step to another process, and a plat still has to be reviewed. He also added that the City of Caldwell may insist on connecting to city services unless waived by the Commission.

MOTION: Commissioner Sheets moved to close public testimony on Case No. RZ2022-0012, seconded by Commissioner Nevill. Voice vote, motion carried.

Deliberation:

Commissioner Sheets commented that the applicant came back with their application having completed the previously requested items, so he would be in favor.

Commissioner Mathews agreed with Commissioner Sheets, although he is reluctant due to all the new development changing the migratory patterns for the birds in the area. He is in favor due to the applicant meeting all requirements.

MOTION: Commissioner Sheets moved to **recommend approval** for Case No. RZ2022-0012 to the Board of County Commissioners, finding that the application does meet criteria and approving all conditions. Seconded by Commissioner Mathews.

Discussion on the Motion:

None.

Roll call vote: 4 in favor, 0 opposed, motion passed.

Item 2C:

<u>Case No. CR2022-0025 – Callister</u>: Callister LLC represented by Ardurra is requesting a Conditional Rezone of approximately 45.8 acres from an "A" (Agricultural) zone to a "CR-R1" (Conditional Rezone – Single-Family Residential) zone on parcel R37617010B. The request includes a development agreement to limit residential development to 37 residential lots. The subject property is located approximately 1345 feet south of Purple Sage Road on the east side of Lansing Lane, Middleton.

Chairman Sturgill called the applicant to testify.

Kim Trout – (Applicant) IN FAVOR – 3778 N Plantation River Dr, Boise, ID 83703

Mr. Trout started by stating all 8 conditions and the consistency with the comprehensive plan have been met for this application. He explained the applicant is willing to provide areas for school bus stops as needed and to equip all homes with approved sprinkler systems. The proposed lot size adheres to Canyon County's policies and requirements. The applicant is dedicating 50 feet of right of way on Lansing Lane and providing alternative routes to mitigate traffic concerns. The area does not meet the threshold for a traffic impact study. Mr. Trout continued to explain the sprinkler installations would mitigate emergency service concerns, and the proposed site is compatible with surrounding land use. He requests approval.

Commissioner Nevill confirmed that the subject property has been out of production since last year. He asked for more clarification on how this area is transitioning, and Mr. Trout stated the properties to the west and south are transitioning, which would likely cause the subject property to become an agricultural island. It was also confirmed there has not been a date set for the installation of a traffic light that the applicant would be willing to pay their proportion for. Commissioner Nevill asked about the school capacities and firefighting systems. Mr. Trout stated there would be an estimate of 17 more students that might be coming from this development, but does not believe this would add to the capacity issue. He also mentioned that he was unaware of any conditions at this time that require anything more than what was proposed regarding firefighting systems. Commissioner Nevill further asked about a community water system, and Mr. Trout stated it was a non-starter and would be a \$600,00-\$700,00 impact to the development. Commissioner Nevill commented that the developer's economics are not taken into consideration, but rather the land use and water.

Commissioner Sheets also asked for clarification on the proportional share for the traffic light. Mr. Trout did not have a definite answer.

Chairman Sturgill asked if any of the surrounding developments had a recent traffic impact study, to which Mr. Trout did not have an answer. There was also no answer on the fire response and target times.

Commissioner Mathews asked if Mr. Callister just recently acquired this property, to which Mr. Trout stated his client was shaking his head yes.

Planner Deb Root reviewed the Staff Report for the record.

Chairman Sturgill asked if there was a value on how much this development is going to impact services that are already authorized. Planner Root was unable to give a value.

Chairman Sturgill affirmed the witnesses to testify.

Testimony:

<u>Cheryl Palange – IN OPPOSITION – 9155 Pursuit Dr. Middleton, ID 83644</u>

Ms. Palange expressed her concerns around the lot sizes. She described previously approved plats and their lot sizes, and shared that $2/3^{rd}$ of the proposed property have lot sizes smaller than an acre. She also elaborated that the estimated number of children at the schools would be more like 22, and the elementary schools are already full. Ms. Palange also expressed concerns regarding traffic, and agreed that the installation of a traffic light could take a while. With how high the speed limit is in the area, there are concerns of higher levels of danger with 2 outlets right across from each other.

Ms. Palange's three (3) minutes of testimony expired. Chairman Sturgill approved an extra minute of testimony.

Ms. Palange continued that her subdivision was supposed to have both fire hydrants and sprinklers and has neither, and was curious on how the applicant will ensure there is adequate firefighting systems. Ms. Palange's last concern was regarding the lack of maintenance of the common spaces.

Commissioner Nevill asked if the subject property was in production. Ms. Palange stated she drove by recently and can clearly see something is growing. Commissioner Nevill asked if there had been any documented issues with wells, to which Ms. Palange answered her subdivision had not had any issues, but some of the older surrounding ones may have.

Melissa Stead - IN OPPOSITION - 9265 Tule Dr, Middleton, ID 83644

Ms. Stead stated her main concerns are regarding traffic and safety risks. Where the bus stops go will be a huge concern. There will be a strain on public services and an overpopulation of the schools. Although she understands the growth that is inevitable, Ms. Stead said she is not in favor of seeing another agricultural land turn into another development. She would advocate for a minimum of 2-acre lots, which will allow the owner to continue to sell and make use of the land, but will help control the impact to schools, public services, and traffic.

Chairman Sturgill asked about the number of developments that have been authorized but not yet developed. Ms. Stead believes there are over 7 different approved developments with less that 1-acre lots, which adds to the overpopulation scale they are seeing in Middleton.

Kim Trout - (Applicant) REBUTTAL - 3778 N Plantation River Dr, Boise, ID 83703

Mr. Trout commented on the growth in the field, stating the former rancher/farmer is no longer renting the property, all irrigation equipment has been removed, and it is volunteer growth. He agreed that the area is growing, but the potential impact to schools, public services, etc. is just speculation. He believes the developer has met all requirements under the county's zoning and ordinances. He also stated the average of the lot size has been met, and it is not a remedy to impose a standard on the developer that doesn't exist in county ordinance. Mr. Trout answered the questions regarding sprinklers, and that it was a recommendation from the Middleton Fire Department, and the building inspectors would need to verify the sprinklers have been installed as required on the building permits.

Chairman Sturgill provided evidence and statistics of the elementary schools being over capacity, and asked how the applicant would address that impact. Mr. Trout commented that he believes that would be up to the citizens and not to the development community to address that issue.

MOTION: Commissioner Nevill moved to close public testimony on Case No. CR2022-0025, seconded by Commissioner Sheets. Voice vote, motion carried.

Deliberation:

Commissioner Nevill stated he is not in favor of this application, and added that questions 3, 6, and 8 could be strengthened.

Commissioner Sheets complimented Mr. Trout in his presentation, and agreed with Commissioner Nevill.

Commissioner Mathews added that it is a cumulative impact of the development on the traffic, public services, and schools.

MOTION: Commissioner Nevill moved to **recommend denial** for Case No. CR2022-0025, to the Board of County Commissioners, and modify the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law & Order to revise findings for question 3, in regard to the proposed conditional rezone not being compatible with surrounding land uses, question 6, in regard to the impact to traffic, and question 8, in regard to the impact to public services. Seconded by Commissioner Sheets.

Discussion on Motion:

Commissioner Sheet suggested options to reducing capacity for the schools, and added the affected intersections are addressed and the addition of any residential units in the area until improved would be inappropriate.

Roll call vote: 4 in favor, 0 opposed, motion passed.

3. DIRECTOR, PLANNER, COMMISSION COMMENTS:

There was discussion on whether or not to keep the hearing for July 3, 2025. It was decided to continue with the hearing and correlating documents from the May 15, 2025 hearing would be sent to Chairman Sturgill so he could choose to participate in the final vote for the case being presented on July 3. There was also discussion on the status of obtaining more commissioners.

4. ADJOURNMENT:

MOTION: Commissioner Nevill moved to adjourn, seconded by Commissioner Sheets. Voice vote, motion carried. Hearing adjourned at 9:12 P.M.

An audio recording is on file in the Development Services Departments' office.

Approved this 3rd day of July, 2025

Robert Sturgill, Chairman

Photos o

ATTEST

Caitlin Ross, Hearing Specialist

utlen Ross